## Perpendicular Bisectors and Few Distinct Distances



Adam Sheffer
Tel Aviv University / Caltech


## Joint Work with...



Ben
Lund

Frank
de Zeeuw

## Distinct Distances

- How many DD (Distinct Distances) are determined by pairs of points?


4
2

## Extremal Problem

- Erdős. What is the minimum number of $D D$ that can be determined by a set of $n$ points in the plane?



## A Word from Erdős

- For the celebrations of his 80 'th birthday, Erdős compiled a survey of his favorite contributions to mathematics, in which he wrote
"My most striking contribution to geometry is, no doubt, my problem on the number of distinct distances."


## Simple Upper Bounds

- Evenly spaced on a line: $n-1$ DD.

- Regular $n$-gon: $\left\lfloor\frac{n}{2}\right\rfloor D D$.



## An Improved Upper Bound

- Erdős '46: A $\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n}$ integer lattice determines $O\left(\frac{n}{\sqrt{\log n}}\right) D D$.
- Landau-Ramanujan: There are $O\left(\frac{n}{\sqrt{\log n}}\right)$ integers of size at most $n$ that can be expressed as the sum of two squares.
$\sqrt{\left(x_{1}-x_{2}\right)^{2}+\left(y_{1}-y_{2}\right)^{2}}$

| Authors + Year | Bound |
| :--- | :---: |
| Erdős `46 & \(\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{1 / 2}\right)\) \\ \hline Moser `52 | $\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{2 / 3}\right)$ |
| Chung `84 & \(\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{5 / 7}\right)\) \\ \hline \begin{tabular}{l}  Chung, Szemerèdi, and \\ Trotter `92 |  | \& $\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{4 / 5} / \log n\right)$ <br>

\hline Szèkely `97 & \(\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{4 / 5}\right)\) \\ \hline Solymosi and Tóth `01 \& $\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{6 / 7}\right)$ <br>
\hline Tardos `01 & \(\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{0.8634}\right)\) \\ \hline Katz and Tardos `04 \& $\boldsymbol{\Omega}\left(n^{0.8641}\right)$ <br>
\hline Guth and Katz `10 \& $\boldsymbol{\Omega}(n / \log n)$ <br>
\hline
\end{tabular}

## Open Variant: Distinct distances in $\mathbb{R}^{3}$

- Upper bound: $O\left(n^{2 / 3}\right)$.
- Obtained from $n^{1 / 3} \times n^{1 / 3} \times n^{1 / 3}$ grid.
- Lower bound: $\Omega^{*}\left(n^{3 / 5}\right)$.
- Obtained by combining the results in Solymosi and Vu `08 and in Guth and Katz `10.


## Variant \#2: Optimal Configurations

- Problem. Characterize the sets of $n$ points that determine $O(n / \sqrt{\log n}) D D$.
- Some known examples:



## Conjectures by Erdős

- Conjecture. A configuration that determines $O(n / \sqrt{\log n}) D D$ must have lattice structure.
- Every such set can be covered by a relatively small number of lines.
- For every such set there exists a line that contains $\Omega(\sqrt{n})$ points of the set.
- A line that contains $\Omega\left(n^{\varepsilon}\right)$ points of the set?
- Szemerédi (1975?). There exists a line that contains $\Omega(\sqrt{\log n})$ points of the set.


## Rectangular Lattices

- For every integer $r>1$, consider the lattice

$$
L_{r}=\{(i, j \sqrt{r} \mid i, j \in \mathbb{N} \quad 1 \leq i, j \leq \sqrt{n}\} .
$$

- The number of $D D$ spanned by any $L_{r}$ is $O(n / \sqrt{\log n})$.
- Relies on a generalization of the Landau-Ramanujan result, originally from Bernays' 1912 Ph.D. dissertation, under the supervision of Landau.


## What is Known

- $P$ - a set of $n$ points spanning $O(n / \sqrt{\log n}) D D$.
- Szemerédi (1975?). There exists a line that contains $\Omega(\sqrt{\log n})$ points of $P$ (can be improved to $\Omega(\log n)$ using modern tools).
- Pach and de Zeeuw `14 and S', Zahl, and de Zeeuw `14:
- No line contains $\Omega\left(n^{7 / 8}\right)$ points of $P$.
- No circle contains $\Omega\left(n^{5 / 6}\right)$ Points of $P$.
- No other irreducible constant-degree polynomial curve contains $\Omega\left(n^{3 / 4}\right)$ points of $P$.


## New Properties

- Theorem (Lund, $\mathrm{S}^{\prime}$, de Zeeuw). Given a set $P$ of $n$ points spanning $O(n / \sqrt{\log n})$ $D D$. For any $k=O\left(n^{1 / 2}\right)$, at least one of the following holds:
- The exists a line or a circle containing $\Omega(k)$ points of $P$.
- There exist $\Omega\left(\frac{n^{8 / 5-\varepsilon}}{k^{4 / 3}} \log ^{1 / 12} n\right)$ lines that contain $\Omega(\sqrt{\log n})$ points of $P$.


## Many Collinear Triples

- Sylvester. A set of $n$ points on a cubic curve that form a group yield about $\frac{n^{2}}{6}$ collinear triples.
- No line contains four points of the set.



## Lines with $k$ points

- Solymosi and Stojaković `13. For any integer $k>3$, there exists a set $P$ of $n$ points in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ with $\Omega\left(n^{2-c / \sqrt{\log n}}\right)$ lines that contain $k$ points of $P$ and no line that contains $k+1$ points of $P$.
- What happens when $k$ depends on $n$ ?



## Our Hope

- Conjecture. Let $P$ be a set of $n$ points in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$. If there exist $\Omega\left(n^{8 / 5-\varepsilon}\right)$ lines that contain $\Omega(\sqrt{\log n})$ points of $P$, then there exists a constant-degree (cubic?) curve that contains $n^{\beta}$ points of $P$.



## Bisector Energy

- $P$ - a set of $n$ points in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$.
- For any $a, b \in P$, we denote by $\boldsymbol{B}_{a b}$ the perpendicular bisector of $a$ and $b$.
- The bisector energy of $P$ is the cardinality of the set
$\boldsymbol{B}(P)=\left\{(a, b, c, d) \in P^{4} \mid \boldsymbol{B}_{a b}=\boldsymbol{B}_{c d}\right\}$.



## Trivial Energy Bounds

$$
\boldsymbol{B}(P)=\left\{(a, b, c, d) \in P^{4} \mid \boldsymbol{B}_{a b}=\boldsymbol{B}_{c d}\right\} .
$$

- What is a trivial upper bound on $|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|$ ?
- For any choice of $a, b, c$, there is at most one valid choice for $d$.
- Thus, $|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|=O\left(n^{3}\right)$.



## Trivial Energy Bounds

$$
\boldsymbol{B}(P)=\left\{(a, b, c, d) \in P^{4} \mid \boldsymbol{B}_{a b}=\boldsymbol{B}_{c d}\right\} .
$$

- What is a trivial lower bound on $|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|$ ?
- $|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|=\Omega\left(n^{3}\right)$.


## Bisector Energy Bound

- Theorem (Lund, $\mathrm{S}^{\prime}$, de Zeeuw). Let $P$ be a set of $n$ points in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$, such that every line or circle contains $O(m)$ points of $P$. Then

$$
|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|=O\left(m^{2 / 5} n^{12 / 5+\varepsilon}+m n^{2}\right) .
$$

- Conjecture. The correct bound is $|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|=O^{*}\left(m n^{2}\right)$.
- Our bound matches this when

$$
m=\Omega\left(n^{2 / 3+\varepsilon}\right) .
$$

- Matching lower bound for any $m$.


## Bisector Energy: Lower Bound

- Every line or circle contains $O(\mathrm{~m})$ points of $P$.
- We wish to prove $|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|=\Omega^{*}\left(m n^{2}\right)$.
- When $m=\Omega\left(n^{1 / 2}\right)$, we can take an $m \times(n / m)$ integer lattice.


## Bisector Energy: Lower Bound (2)

- Every line or circle contains $O(\mathrm{~m})$ points of $P$.
- We wish to prove

$$
|\boldsymbol{B}(P)|=\Omega\left(m n^{2}\right) .
$$

- For any $m$ :
- $m / 2$ ellipses, evenly spaced above each other.
- Every ellipse contains $2 n / m$ points, with reflection symmetry around its horizontal axis.


## Distinct Bisectors

- $D B(P)$ - the number of distinct bisectors spanned by pairs of points of $P$.
- Corollary. Let $P$ be a set of $n$ points in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$, such that every line or circle contains $O(m)$ points of $P$. Then

$$
D B(P)=\Omega\left(\min \left\{\frac{n^{8 / 5-\varepsilon}}{m^{2 / 5}}, \frac{n^{2}}{m}\right\}\right)
$$

## Distinct Bisectors: Proof Sketch

- For a line $\ell$, we set

$$
E_{\ell}(P)=\left\{(a, b) \in P^{2} \mid \boldsymbol{B}_{a b}=\ell\right\} .
$$

- By the Cauchy-Schwartz inequality

$$
\begin{aligned}
|\boldsymbol{B}(P)| & =\sum_{\ell}\binom{\left|E_{\ell}(P)\right|}{2} \geq \frac{\left(\sum_{\ell}\left|E_{\ell}(P)\right|\right)^{2}}{D B(P)} \\
& =\Omega\left(\frac{n^{4}}{D B(P)}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

- The bound is obtained by combining this with the upper bound for $\boldsymbol{B}(P)$.


## From Few Distinct Distances to Bisector Energy

- $P$ - a set of $n$ points, such that pairs of points span $O(n / \sqrt{\log n}) D D$.

$$
T=\left\{(a, b, c) \in P^{3}| | a b|=|a c|\} .\right.
$$

- For any $a \in P$, the points of $P \backslash\{p\}$ are contained in $O(n / \sqrt{\log n})$ circles centered at $a$.
${ }^{\circ} P_{a, i}$ - the set of points of $P$ on the $i^{\prime}$ th circle around $a$.



## Counting Triples

$$
T=\left\{(a, b, c) \in P^{3}| | a b|=|a c|\} .\right.
$$

- $P_{a, i}$ - the set of points of $P$ on the $i^{\prime}$ th circle around $a$. Notice that $\sum_{i}\left|P_{a, i}\right|=n-1$.
- By the Cauchy-Schwarz inequality

$$
\begin{aligned}
|T|= & \sum_{a \in P} \sum_{i}\binom{\left|P_{a, i}\right|}{2}=n \cdot \Omega\left(\frac{n^{2}}{n / \sqrt{\log n}}\right) \\
& =\Omega\left(n^{2} \sqrt{\log n}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$



## Counting Triples Again

$$
T=\left\{(a, b, c) \in P^{3}| | a b|=|a c|\} .\right.
$$

- A triple $(a, b, c) \in P^{3}$ is in $T$ iff $\boldsymbol{B}_{b c}$ is incident to $a$.
- $|T|$ is the number of incidences between $P$ and a multiset of $\binom{n}{2}$ lines.
- By our lower bound for $|T|$, the number of incidences is $\Omega\left(n^{2} \sqrt{\log n}\right)$.
- How is this possible?



## Taking Multiplicities into Account

- Every line of "multiplicity" at least $k$ contributes $\Omega(k)$ to the energy.
- By the bound on the energy, the number of such lines is

$$
O\left(\frac{m^{2 / 5} n^{12 / 5+\varepsilon}+m n^{2}}{k}\right)
$$

- Since no line contains $>m$ points of $P$, lines of multiplicity $\geq k=\Theta\left(m^{7 / 5} n^{2 / 5+\varepsilon}\right)$ cannot yield $\Omega\left(n^{2} \sqrt{\log n}\right)$ incidences.


## Lines with a Low Multiplicity

- There are $\Omega\left(n^{2} \sqrt{\log n}\right)$ incidences between the point set $P$ and a multiset of lines with multiplicities $O\left(m^{7 / 5} n^{2 / 5+\varepsilon}\right)$.
- Lines with $o(\sqrt{\log n})$ points also cannot yield $\Omega\left(n^{2} \sqrt{\log n}\right)$ incidences.
- A straightforward analysis shows that the number of remaining lines is $\Omega\left(m^{-7 / 5} n^{8 / 5-\varepsilon}\right)$.



## Bounding the Bisector Energy

$$
\boldsymbol{B}(P)=\left\{(a, b, c, d) \in P^{4} \mid \boldsymbol{B}_{a b}=\boldsymbol{B}_{c d}\right\} .
$$

- A quadruple $(a, b, c, d) \in P^{4}$ is in $\boldsymbol{B}(P)$ iff $\left(a_{x}-b_{x}\right)\left(c_{y}-d_{y}\right)=\left(c_{x}-d_{x}\right)\left(a_{y}-b_{y}\right)$, and

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \left(a_{y}-b_{y}\right)\left(a_{y}+b_{y}-c_{y}-d_{y}\right) \\
& \quad=\left(a_{x}-b_{x}\right)\left(c_{x}+d_{x}-a_{x}-b_{x}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Incidences in $\mathbb{R}^{4}$

- We consider quadruples $(a, b, c, d) \in P^{4}$.
- For every pair $(b, d)$, define a point in $\mathbb{R}^{4}$.
- For every pair $(a, c)$, define a twodimensional surface in $\mathbb{R}^{4}$, defined by

$$
\left(a_{x}-z_{1}\right)\left(c_{y}-z_{4}\right)=\left(c_{x}-z_{3}\right)\left(a_{y}-z_{2}\right)
$$ and

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \left(a_{y}-z_{2}\right)\left(a_{y}+z_{2}-c_{y}-z_{4}\right) \\
& \quad=\left(a_{x}-z_{1}\right)\left(c_{x}+z_{3}-a_{x}-z_{1}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Solving the Incidence Problem

- Some high level details:
- We show that the incidence graph contains no copy of $K_{2, m}$.
- We show that the incidence graph can be partitioned to many connected components with no edges between them.



